#### REFERENCE NO: CR/2016/1039/FUL

LOCATION: CRAWLEY DENTAL CLINIC, 158 BUCKSWOOD DRIVE, GOSSOPS GREEN, CRAWLEY PROPOSAL: ERECTION OF SINGLE STOREY FRONT EXTENSION AND CHANGE OF USE OF PART RESIDENTIAL (C3) TO DENTAL CLINIC (D1) TO CREATE AN EXTRA SURGERY AND ENLARGED WAITING ROOM, AND CREATION OF SELF CONTAINED FIRST FLOOR FLAT ABOVE. (AMENDED DESCRIPTION, PLANS AND DESIGN & ACCESS STATEMENT RECEIVED)

**TARGET DECISION DATE:**14 March 2017

CASE OFFICER: Ms K. Ingram

APPLICANTS NAME:Mr M BothaAGENTS NAME:Carl Moore

#### PLANS & DRAWINGS CONSIDERED:

CBC 0001 - Location Plan at a scale of 1:1250, OS-179-07 recevied 19/04/2017 - Existing Floor & Elevation Plans, OS-179-08 received 19/04/17 - Proposed Floor & Elevation Plans, CBC 0002 Rev B - Block Plan

#### CONSULTEE(S) NOTIFICATIONS & RESPONSES:-

- 1. WSCC Highways
- 2. CBC Environmental Health

No objection subject to conditions No objection

#### **NEIGHBOUR NOTIFICATIONS:-**

Initial consultations: 34, 35 and 36 Rosedale Close; 153, 156 and 160 Buckswood Drive.

The application was amended and consultation letters sent to: 34, 35 and 36 Rosedale Close; 150, 151, 152, 153, 154, 156, 160, 164 and 168 Buckswood Drive.

#### **RESPONSES RECEIVED:-**

The initial application generated 10 responses from 8 different addresses objecting on the following grounds:

- impact on neighbouring amenity by way of bringing the surgery rooms closer to the adjoining dwellings.
- the scale of the rear extension and side roof would be inappropriate given scale of surrounding built form.
- the expansion will exacerbate existing problems caused by patients frequently blocking surrounding driveways.
- the dentist is already relatively large for a residential area and the extension could potentially create another two surgeries.

The re-consultation on the amended plans generated 5 objections from 4 addresses. Most letters stated that previous comments regarding inconsiderate on-street parking apply to the revised scheme, and the following additional comments have been made:

# Highways and parking

- The expansion will exacerbate daily problems of patients and delivery vehicles blocking nearby residents' driveways which is inconvenient and has led to incidents of verbal abuse and vandalism.
- On street parking causing highway safety risks and worry as residents cannot see vehicles and pedestrians, often school children from the local secondary school, when pulling out. This gets worse during school pick up and drop off times.
- White lines should be painted across driveways to prevent more cases of inconsiderate parking
- 5 spaces on the site will not work, it will block in 2 vehicles.

### Expansion in a residential area

- The number of clients in the Design and Access Statement does not take into account the overlap of patients waiting.
- Is a dental practice of this size reasonable in a residential area?
- The proposed room for use as Oral Health/Recovery room could easily be converted into another surgery
- This dentist over the past 25 years has changed from 1 dentist, to a clinic with 4 surgeries operating a full day on Saturday.
- There are no other dental surgeries in Crawley of this size.

### Impact on neighbouring amenity

- The compressor should remain in its current location with the door always closed.
- How will the patients reach the new clinic entrance?
- The office use in the existing conservatory will have a detrimental impact on neighbouring amenity by way of day to day office noise especially in the summer.

# **REASON FOR REPORTING TO COMMITTEE:-**

The application received more than 4 neighbour objections.

# **THE APPLICATION SITE:-**

- 1.1 The application site is located on the western side of Buckswood Drive and is occupied by a detached chalet style building which has an appearance of a dwelling house. It accommodates a dental practice at ground floor together with a separate residential unit on the ground and first floor. The two uses share the private rear amenity area.
- 1.2 The practice has an internal floor area of 80sqm and comprises 4 surgeries, a reception area and ancillary rooms. The dwelling house has a separate entrance, with living areas on ground floor and 3 bedrooms and a study on first floor.
- 1.3 The site is in an established residential area surrounded by similar looking two storey chalet dwellings. The street scene is characterised with open front amenity areas. The site is located 140m north of Holy Trinity C of E Secondary School.

### THE PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT:-

- 2.1 The application is seeking to expand the clinic and to obtain permission for the following:
  - Erection of a single storey front/side extension measuring 4.8m in length x 2.9m in width x 2.6m to the eaves x 3.6m to the ridge height to accommodate a fifth practice room which will be an 'Oral Health Education / Recovery room'.
  - Internal reconfiguration, new entrance door and a change of use of the ground floor residential component (40sqm) into a dental practice use to provide for larger communal and office areas and waiting room

- A two bedroom flat (C3) will be created on the first floor, accessed by a new front entrance door and existing stairs
- The existing decontamination room and flat roof above will be partially reconstructed to repair structural damp.
- 2.2 Operating hours proposed are 08:00 18:00 Monday, Tuesday & Thursday, 08:00 19:30 Wednesday and 08:00 17:00 Saturday.
- 2.3 The Design and Access statement states that there are currently 4 patients, 4 dentists and 4 dental assistants in treatment and 3 office staff in the practice at any one time plus waiting patients. The expansion will result in 1 additional dental heath practitioner and 1 additional patient (and family) on site at any one time in treatment.
- 2.4 The original proposal comprised the retention of the ground floor residential quarters and a rear extension to the dental practice of 4.5m wide x 9.2m deep and a pitched roof on the existing northern side extension. This was considered out of keeping with the scale of the existing and surrounding buildings.

# PLANNING HISTORY:-

- 3.1 CR/173/1961– Amended layout plan and revised details of house types 305, 319, 319A in respect of the proposed erection of 79 dwelling houses and garages with vehicular access land on both sides of Buckswood Drive and adjacent to Crawley By-pass APPROVED
- 3.2 CR/532/1961- Proposed amendment to original layout and house types to provide for the erection of 83 dwelling houses and garages with combined vehicular and pedestrian access land on both side of Buckswood Drive and adjacent to Crawley By-pass APPROVED
- 3.3 CR/380/1973 Use of garage as recovery and staff room, erection of car port and x-ray room REFUSED
- 3.4 CR/579/1973 Use of garage as a recovery room and staff room, and erection of a car port and xray room in connection with existing dental use –APPROVED - Implemented (existing side and rear extension)
- 3.5 CR/1997/0085/FUL Resurfacing of existing drive and provision of additional car parking and crossover. Construction of new driveway and crossover APPROVED Implemented
- 3.6 CR/1997/0086/ADV Display of one externally illuminated entrance sign and one non-illuminated hours of opening sign APPROVED Implemented
- 3.7 CR/1999/0547/FUL Erection of single storey rear and front extensions for larger waiting area and additional treatment room and installation of pitched roof Withdrawn

# PLANNING POLICY:-

- 4.1 <u>National Planning Policy Framework (2012)</u>
  - Paragraph 14: (Presumption in favour of sustainable development). The National Planning Policy Framework is a presumption in favour of sustainable development, which should be seen as a golden thread running through both plan-making and decision-taking
  - Paragraph 17 (Core planning principles). Always seek to secure high quality design and a good standard of amenity for all existing and future occupants of land and buildings.
  - Chapter 7 (Requiring good design). The Government attaches great importance to the design of the built environment. Good design is a key aspect of sustainable development, is indivisible from good planning, and should contribute positively to making places better for people.
  - Paragraph 36 Development should only be prevented or refused on transport grounds where the residual cumulative impacts of development are severe.

#### 4.2 Crawley Borough Local Plan (2015-2030)

- Policy H1 (Housing Provision) the Council will positively consider proposals for the provision of housing to meet local housing needs. Paragraph 6.20 of the supporting text states that empty housing should be brought back into residential use. Proposals for residential development should generally be approved where there is an identified need for additional housing provided there are no reasons why the development would be inappropriate.
- Policy CH1 (Presumption in Favour of Sustainable Development). The council will work proactively in partnership with applicants, stakeholders and other partners to jointly find solutions which mean that development can be approved wherever possible, whilst securing development that improves the economic, social and environmental conditions of Crawley
- Policy CH2 (Principles of Good Urban Design). New development proposals will be required to respond to and reinforce locally distinctive patterns of development and landscape character.
- Policy CH3 (Normal Requirements of All New Development). All proposals for development in Crawley will be required to make a positive contribution to the area, be of a high quality design, provide and retain a good standard of amenity for all nearby and future occupants of land and buildings, for example by way of overlooking, dominance or overshadowing, traffic generation and general activity, and be able to meet its own operational requirements necessary for the safe and proper use of the site.
- Policy CH5 (Standards for All New Dwellings (including conversions). All new dwellings must create a safe, comfortable and sustainable living environment, capable of adapting to the changing needs of residents. The Nationally Described Space Standards will apply.
- Policy ENV6 (Sustainable Design and Construction). All development, including the alteration and extension of existing buildings, should consider how it may achieve the following sustainability objectives in relation to carbon:
  - Take an active approach to reducing its need to consume energy
  - Utilise renewable and low carbon energy technologies where appropriate
  - Look at ways to improve the existing building when adding improvements or extensions
- Minimise the amount of carbon emitted throughout the implementation and construction process
- Policy ENV9 (Tackling Water Stress). For non-residential development, where technically feasible and viable, development should meet BREEAM Excellent including addressing maximum water efficiencies under the mandatory water credits
- Policy ENV10 (Pollution Management and Land Contamination). Development including extensions and intensification of existing uses, will be permitted where the proposed use:
- Policy ENV11 (Development and Noise). Noise generating development will only be permitted where it can be demonstrated that nearby noise sensitive uses will not be exposed to noise impact that will adversely affect existing and future users.
- Policy IN1 (Infrastructure Provision) Development will be permitted where it is supported by the necessary infrastructure both on and off site
- Policy IN4 (Car and Cycle Parking Standards)

# 4.3 Urban Design Supplementary Planning Document

The Urban Design SPD is a non-statutory document which supplements the policies of the Local Plan and is applicable to this application. It contains guidelines on the standards the Council expects for the design of extensions. Relevant provisions comprise:

- An extension with good design in mind will relate appropriately to the parent dwelling's character and style, dimensions, materials and finishes of the parent dwelling and character of the neighbourhood (3.5)
- A matching roof pitch is likely to be more suitable (3.12)
- Front extensions should be subservient to the rest of the house and should not extend across the whole width of the property (3.15)
- A 1 or 2 occupant dwelling should provide for 45m2 of external amenity space (3.51)
- Non-residential development should address the street and public realm in a considerate manner (3.62)

# PLANNING CONSIDERATIONS:-

- 5.1 The issues to be considered are:
  - Use of the building
  - Design and impact on visual amenities, the streetscene and the wider area

- Highways and Parking
- Impact on neighbouring amenity
- Amenity of existing and future occupants of the residential dwelling
- Other

### Use of the building

5.2 The original planning approvals for the street layout do not indicate that the building was originally granted consent as a dentist. There is no explicit approval for a change of use to a dental practice on file. However, the planning history does show that the use has been in place and likely to have been continuous since at least 1973. Both the existing surgery and residential elements are considered to be lawful uses of the building.

#### Design and impact on visual amenities, the streetscene and the wider area

- 5.3 The application proposes to demolish the front/side carport which currently houses a ramp access to the practice entrance and erect a single storey side/front extension in its place flush with the front eastern and northern side elevations with a false front pitched roof. The roof would match the pitch of the main roof, match the height of the garage on the adjacent property to the north to which the extension would adjoin and would match the eaves height of a canopy on the front elevation of the building. Detailing and materials would match also match existing. It is considered this extension is of a modest size and is in keeping with the design and character of the property.
- 5.4 A new entrance door is proposed in the front elevation of the building to serve the flat, replacing an existing side door which currently serves the staff room. The new entrance door while centrally located on the building is not considered to detract from the character and appearance of the property, and is considered visually acceptable.
- 5.5 While no physical alteration to the building is needed, the main entrance to the dental practice would be relocated from the northern side of the property to the southern side (both on the front eastern elevation). It is not considered this alteration would materially alter the setting or character of the building although a new footpath to the entrance is now proposed to serve the entrance. This new footpath would reduce the amount of grassed front garden area but it is proposed to retain an area of grass and therefore it is considered that the open plan and landscaped character of the area would be retained.
- 5.6 As such, the application would have an acceptable impact on the visual amenities of the site and the streetscene and comply with Policies CH2 and CH3 of the Crawley Borough Local Plan 2015-2030.

#### Highways and Parking

- 5.7 WSCC (Highways) have stated that they "do not anticipate that additional on street parking will be to an unacceptable degree, or that it could occur in locations that would be a detriment to highway safety" given that vehicle speeds are not anticipated to be in excess of the limit and a light volume of traffic is expected on the road. A 'severe' impact on the safe operation of the local road network therefore is not anticipated.
- 5.8 WSCC have recommended that the applicant apply to them for the painting of an Access Protection Line (APL) extending across the dropped kerb of the site, which would keep the access point to the application site clear. WSCC comment that leaving vehicles in a dangerous position and obstructing free passage on a highway are offences under The Road Traffic Act and Highways Act and enforceable by Sussex Police. (These are not planning matters).
- 5.9 The application site has a front hardstanding which accommodates 3 vehicles. 1 space would be allocated to the first floor flat should any approval be issued on this application. The majority of patients and staff park on Buckswood Drive. The application will result in what is likely to be an additional two patient vehicles coming and going to the practice potentially parking on Buckswood Drive. Given the amount of available parking along the street this increase in on-street parking from the use is not considered harmful to warrant a refusal. It is accepted that at school pick up and drop

off times parking demand increases along Buckswood Drive. This is a common issue in urban areas though and is outside the applicant's control.

- 5.10 Planning officers have considered requesting an increase in the hardstanding in the front garden of the property to increase the off street parking capacity but, even with landscaping, it considered that this approach would have an unacceptable impact on the visual amenities of the streetscene, undermining the established residential and open character of Buckswood Drive and therefore the proposals as submitted are acceptable.
- 5.11 Given the advice from WSCC (Highways), the application complies with Policy IN1 of the Crawley Borough Local Plan 2015-2030 and the relevant provisions of the NPPF (2012) and it is not considered that a refusal on parking grounds could be sustained.

#### Impact on neighbouring amenity

- 5.12 Residents have raised concerns about operation of a dental practice with 4 surgeries and an additional 'oral health room' within an established residential area, the scale of the use and the potential for this new space to be converted into a fifth surgery. The Design and Access Statement states that the Oral Health Education Room will be used to provide a programme of oral health education in line with NHS dental contract requirements, or as a recovery room for minor oral surgery patients.
- 5.13 It is considered that the ground floor extension and the change of use to accommodate an additional 53 sqm (approx.) of practice space would not have a detrimental impact on neighbouring amenity by way of an increase in internal noise and activity. The application will result in 1 additional member of staff and 1 additional patient in surgery at any one time. It is considered that the resultant increase in activity to and from the practice will not be very different from existing and would be acceptable. Officers do consider it expedient to limit the hours of opening for the dental practice given the scale of the use and its location in a residential area as surrounding residents should expect a quieter environment at weekends, evenings and public holidays and thus is recommended to limit opening hours on Saturdays to 8.00am 1.00pm and closed on Sundays and public holidays.
- 5.14 It is considered that, as is currently experienced, the greatest impact will be the slight increase in the level of activity generated by comings and goings of patients. A site visit by planning officers during a normal weekday afternoon showed that between 7-10 cars are parked outside the practice and adjoining properties to the north and south (nos. 154-168) with two cars arriving and leaving at 10 to 15 minute intervals. This accounts for an overlap of waiting patients and some staff. This level of activity is considered acceptable. The dwellings are set back 12-15 metres from the highway and as there is generally a low level of on- street resident and visitor parking on Buckswood Drive due to the generous size of the plots, cars are able to easily park.
- 5.15 The proposed side extension would be constructed against the northern side boundary with no. 156 Buckswood Drive. It would be built against an existing brick built garage on that property and would be the same height. It is not considered this structure would be overbearing or have any detrimental impact on the amenities of this neighbouring property.
- 5.16 In conclusion, it is considered that the application would have an acceptable impact on neighbouring amenity and would comply with Policies CH2 and CH3 of the Crawley Borough Local Plan 2015-2030.

#### Amenity of existing and future occupants of flat

- 5.17 The proposed dwelling would have an internal floor area of 76 sqm. The proposed double bedrooms and storage space exceed the requirements in the Standards for all New Dwellings as set out in Policy CH5. In addition there is a large rear garden and access to this space for the flat is to be controlled via condition.
- 5.18 Residents of the dwelling would be unlikely to suffer significant disturbance from the operation of the surgery and, in any case, a similar relationship exists at present.

- 5.19 A condition is recommended on any approval issued to allocate an on-site parking space, a refuse storage area and cycle provision for the residential flat. Plans should also demonstrate amenity space provision for the dwelling.
- 5.20 As such the application would comply with Policy CH3 and CH5 of the Crawley Borough Local Plan 2015-2030 and the relevant provisions of the Urban Design SPD.

### <u>Other</u>

5.21 The application does not propose to change the existing arrangement of housing the dental compressor in the rear shed. CBC Environmental Health were consulted on the application and have no concern in this regard

### CONCLUSIONS:-

- 6.1 It is considered that the additional surgery and a change of use of the residential element of the ground floor of the building to the dental practice would not have a demonstrably harmful impact on neighbouring amenity by way of noise and activity within the building or the in the wider area. The impact of the proposal on the highway has been considered and the proposal is not considered detrimental to highway safety. The external alterations would have an acceptable visual impact on the site and the wider area. The amenity of the occupants of the flat will be secured by the imposition of certain conditions and an appropriate living space would be provided in line with adopted standards.
- 6.2 The application complies with Policies H1, CH2, CH3, CH5 and IN1 of the Crawley Borough Local Plan 2015-2030, the relevant provisions of the Urban Design Supplementary Planning Document and of the NPPF (2012), and permission is recommended subject to the following conditions as set out below.

#### RECOMMENDATION RE: CR/2016/1039/FUL

PERMIT- subject to conditions.

- The development hereby permitted shall be begun before the expiration of 3 years from the date of this permission.
  REASON: To comply with Section 91 of the Town & Country Planning Act 1990.
- 2 The development hereby permitted shall not be carried out other than in accordance with the approved plans as listed in this Decision Notice save as varied by the conditions hereafter. REASON: For the avoidance of doubt and in the interests of proper planning.
- 3 The materials and finishes of the external walls (and roof(s)) of the extension hereby permitted shall match in colour and texture those of the existing building(s). REASON: In the interests of amenity in accordance with Policy CH3 of the Crawley Borough Local Plan 2015-2030.
- The premises shall only be open to the public between the hours of : 0800 – 18:00 Monday, Tuesday, Thursday & Friday 0800 – 19:30 Wednesdays 0800 – 13:00 on Saturdays and at no other times. The premises shall not be open on Sundays or Bank Holidays. REASON: To ensure the level of activity at the site does not harm the amenities of nearby occupiers in accordance with policy CH3 of the Crawley Borough Local Plan 2015-2030.
- 5 The new waiting room and office shall not be brought into use until the flat conversion has been completed and the dwelling made available for use. REASON: To accord with policy H1 and to ensure there are no loss of dwellings as a result of the development.

6 The flat conversion shall not be occupied until provision is made for an allocated parking space, refuse / cycle provision and amenity space provision for the dwelling have been provided in accordance with plans and details to be submitted to and agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The development shall be implemented and thereafter maintained in accordance with the agreed details.

REASON: To ensure that the operational requirements for the dwelling are met in accordance with policy CH3 of the Crawley Borough Local Plan 2015-2030.

7 The waiting room and office shall not be brought into use until details of the refuse provision and servicing arrangements for the dental practice are submitted to and agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The development shall be implemented and thereafter maintained in accordance with the agreed details.

REASON: to ensure that the operational requirements for the dental practice are met in accordance with policy CH3 of the Crawley Borough Local Plan 2015-2030.

#### NPPF Statement

In determining this planning application, the Local Planning Authority assessed the proposal against all material considerations and has worked with the applicant in a positive and proactive manner based on seeking solutions where possible and required, by:

- Liaising with applicant and agent and discussing the proposal where considered appropriate and necessary in a timely manner during the course of the determination of the application.
- Seeking amended plans and additional information to address identified issues during the course of the application.

This decision has been taken in accordance with the requirement in the National Planning Policy Framework, as set out in article 35, of the Town and Country Planning (Development Management Procedure) Order 2015.

